SELECTION OF ONE PROFESSOR (LEVEL 1 – PROFESSORE ORDINARIO), FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 09/G2 "BIOENGINEERING" AT THE INSTITUTE OF BIOROBOTICS - ACADEMIC CLASS OF EXPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, RESERVED, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 6, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, FOR ASSOCIATE PROFESSORS AND RESEARCHERS EMPLOYED AT THE SCHOOL, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 614 DATED 04/10/2021.

MINUTES OF THE PRELIMINARY MEETING

The Review Committee for the selection of one professor (level 1) for the academic recruitment field Academic Recruitment Field 09/G2 "Bioengineering" – Academic Discipline ING-IND/34 "Industrial Bioengineering" at the Institute of BioRobotics of the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna di Pisa reserved for associate professors and researchers employed at the School to be selected pursuant to art. 24, subsection 6 of the Italian law 240/2010, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 667 dated 20/10/2021, consists of:

• Prof. Christian Cipriani, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 09/G2 "Bioengineering" at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, designated expert by the BioRobotics Institute;
• Prof. Luca Citi, Professor at the University of Essex;
• Prof. Alberto Di Minin, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 13/B2 "Management" at the Scuola Superiore Sant’Anna, Member of the Recruitment Committee;
• Prof. Eugenio Guglielmelli, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 09/G2 "Bioengineering" at the Campus Biomedico;
• Prof. Filippo Molinari, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 09/G2 "Bioengineering" at the Politecnico of Torino;
• Prof. Heike Vallery, Professor at the TU Delft.

The committee convened for the first time, via teleconference, on November 5, 2021 at 9.30 from the following locations:

Prof. Cipriani located in his office, connected via email: christian.cipriani@santannapisa.it.
Prof. Citi located in his office, connected via email: lciti@essex.ac.uk.
Prof. Di Minin located in his office, connected via email: alberto.diminin@santannapisa.it.
Prof. Guglielmelli located in his office, connected via email: e.guglielmelli@unicampus.it.
Prof. Molinari located in his office, connected via email: filippo.molinari@polito.it.
Prof. Vallery located in her office, connected via email: h.vallery@tudelft.nl.

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by members of the Committee. Prof. Cipriani was nominated as Chairperson and Prof. Citi as Secretary.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that
they had no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and that there were no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c.

The Committee then reviewed the call (published on the School website https://www.santannapisa.it/it/selezioni-e-concorsi/selezioni-la-copertura-di-sei-posizioni-di-professoreessa-di-prima-fascia) as well as Regulations of the School that regard calls for level 1 and level 2 professors (Arts. 18 and 24 of Law 240/2010), and carried a motion that the committee's work should terminate by November, 20, 2021 (one month from the date of the appointment decree). The Committee ascertained that Personnel Office communicated that one application has been received.

The Committee agreed that the aim of the present meeting was to assess the criteria with which the publications the curricula and teaching activities of the candidate will be evaluated and published on the School's website.

In accordance with Italian Ministerial Decree 344/2011, the following shall be assessed: educational activities, supplementary teaching and service to students, as well as the research activities carried out by the professor.

The Commission will assess the candidate according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification" for teaching and research required for access to didactic positions at the School1, established by the Commission for recruitment, according to the following:

1 Teaching and Research qualification criteria, specifically requested by the Sant’Anna School (decided by Recruitment Committee and approved by the Academic Senate on 15 April 2014 and modified on 20 January 2015):

**Research Activity skills:** the candidates must hold an outstanding ranking in their discipline in terms of quantity and quality of scientific publications; bibliometric criteria may be used if relevant for the scientific area.

**Candidates must submit a document containing a self-assessment of their scientific productions** in the international context. In this document they must explain their strenght by comparison with the best-known colleagues' production and highlighting their relationships and their scientific reputation in the international research networks.

**Teaching Activity skills:** Teaching activity in post-graduate courses, particularly in PhD programs, is requested.

**Participation in research projects:** candidates are required to have been involved in research projects funded through competitive calls e.g. European ERC grants, “Framework Programs” (e.g. Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, STReP, etc) Marie Curie actions, as well as national funding agencies. Ability in fundraising is welcome.

**Publishing activity:** the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations hold by the candidates will be considered for the purpose of the selections.
1. For the assessment of teaching, supplementary teaching and service to students, the Commission will take account of:
a) Number and quality of supervised PhD and MSc theses;
b) Number of courses/modules taught and continuity of teaching activities;
c) Participation in student evaluation committees.

2. Publications such as articles published in journals in paper or digital format, with the exception of internal notes or departmental reports.

The overall consistency of the scientific production of the researcher shall be assessed, the intensity and the temporal continuity of such production, with the exception of periods of involuntary removal from the research with particular reference to parental functions - such periods should be adequately documented. The evaluation of scientific publications will be carried out on the basis of the following additional criteria:

a) originality, innovation, methodological rigor and relevance of each publication;
b) coherence of each publication with the specific profile of a university professor of the second level with closely related interdisciplinary subjects;
c) scientific relevance of each journal / publisher and its impact factor within the scientific community;
d) analytical determination, on the basis of guidelines recognized by the relevant international scientific community of the individual contribution of the researcher in the case of works carried out in partnership;
e) the Commission is also going to use the following indicators, with reference to the start date of the assessment:
   - the total number of citations;
   - the average number of citations per publication;
   - combinations of the above parameters to increase the impact of the candidate's scientific production (Hirsch index or similar).

3. Research activity, exploitation, and industrial leadership

The Commission will take account of:
a) organisation, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups or participation therein.
b) participation as a speaker in national and international conferences;
c) national and international awards for research activities;
d) ownership of patents;
e) participation in academic start-ups.

The Commission will pay particular attention to the scientific output produced by the candidates
after the date of expiry of the call under which they obtained eligibility (“Abilitazione”) in order to check the continuity of their scientific production.

The Committee then establishes the criteria that it adopts for the evaluation of scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the candidate.

*Explain the criteria with reference to the scientific subject area indicated in the announcement of the competition and the criteria for teaching and research required for access to the teaching staff of the School, as established by the Recruitment Committee*

*Assess whether to take minutes of something concerning the identification of the contribution of the co-authors of the publications submitted by applicants (e.g. order of the names, level of consistency with the rest of the scientific/academic reputation of the candidate in the specific subject) and publications written in collaboration with members of the committee.*

Prof. Cipriani opens the envelope containing the name of the candidate and communicate to the Committee that Prof. Nicola Vitiello participate to the selection and each member of the committee declares that he is not:

- a relative, or similar, to the fourth degree with the candidates (as per Art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948);
- in a situation of incompatibility with the candidates (as per articles 51 and 52 of the Code of Civil Procedure);
- in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidates (as per art. 6 bis of the Legislative Decree No 241/1990).

The Committee decides to reconvene on **November 18 2021 at 13.00** in order to assess the scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the candidate. At the end of the meeting, the President will sign the minutes and will send them to the Personnel Office who will then make public the criteria and procedures for the assessment of publications and qualifications.

The attached declarations of the Committee’s members will be sent the Personnel Office too.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:45 AM.

Read, approved and signed,  
The President