
The Committee for the evaluation of Dr. Daniele Moschella, tenure-track – probationary, assistant professor, in the third year of his temporary contract pursuant to Italian Law no. 240/2010, art. 24 paragraph 3 letter B, in order to promote him to Associate Professor in the Academic Recruitment Field 13/A2 “Political Economy” at the Institute of Economics, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 523 dated 06/08/2021, consists of:

- Prof. Giulio Bottazzi, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 13/A2 “Political Economy” at the at the Scuola Superiore Sant’Anna (School), designated expert by the Institute of Economics;
- Prof. Fulvio Castellacci, Professor at the University of Oslo;
- Prof. Valentina Meliciani, Professor Academic Recruitment Field 13/A4 “Applied economics” at the University LUISS Guido Carli;
- Prof. Pierre Mohnen, Professor at the Maastricht University;
- Prof. Pierdomenico Perata, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 05/A2 “Plant Physiology” at the School, member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Massimo Riccaboni, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field Field 13/A4 “Applied economics” at the IMT School.

The Committee convened via teleconference via google meet on October, 9 2021, at 9.00 AM, from the following locations:

Prof. Bottazzi located in Scandiano (RE) (g.bottazzi@santannapisa.it).
Prof. Castellacci located in Oslo (Norway) (fulvio.castellacci@tik.uio.no).
Prof. Meliciani located in Rome (RM), (vmeliciani@luiss.it).
Prof. Mohnen located in Eupen (Belgium) (p.mohnen@maastrichtuniversity.nl).
Prof. Perata located in San Giuliano (PI), (Pierdomenico.Perata@santannapisa.it).
Prof. Riccaboni located in Somaglia (LO), (massimo.riccaboni@imtlucca.it).

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by the members of the Committee.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that they have no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and the candidate, that there are no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c. and that he is not in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidates (as per art. 6 bis of
Prof. Castellacci was nominated as President and Prof. Bottazzi as Secretary.

The Committee then reviewed the Call and especially his article 4 and agreed that the candidate shall be assessed according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification for teaching and research required for access to professoral positions at the School" established by the School’s Commission for Recruitment and set out in article 1 of the Call.

The Committee then carried a motion that the Committee's work should terminate by October, 9, 2021 (two months from the date of the nomination decree).

The members of the Committee stated that the Personnel Office of the School has provided them with an electronic copy of the documentation submitted by the candidate containing: application, curriculum, publications with a declaration in lieu of an affidavit certifying compliance with the original, and a list of all the documents accompanying the application and that they have examined it and made their individual assessments, which are reported in Annex 1 of these minutes.

The Committee then collectively examined the publications, curriculum and teaching activities of the candidate, confronted their individual assessments and reviewed the collegiate assessment annex sub 2 attached to the minutes of which it is an integral part.

Then after a full discussion, the Committee unanimously declared that Dr. Daniele Moschella: is qualified to be appointed as associate professor.

Prof. Perata (Member of the Recruitment Committee) testified that the evaluation of the candidate, the presentation of the individual assessments, the ensuing discussion and, in general, the whole procedure occurred in full compliance with the rules established by Scuola Sant'Anna and its recruitment committee.

Given the conclusion of the selection procedure for one position of associate professor, at the Institute of Economics in the Academic Class of Social Sciences, for the Academic Recruitment 13/A2 “Political Economy” pursuant to art. 24, subsection 5 of Italian law 240/2010, the President declared the work closed.

These minutes, drawn up and signed by the President, and the declarations of attendance that the Committee’s members will individually send, are transmitted to the Personnel Office in order for
these proceedings to be verified, with a decree by the Rector.

The session was closed at 9.30.

Read, approved and signed,

The President
Fulvio Castellacci

[Signature]
Annex 1

INDIVIDUAL ASSESSMENTS

Prof. Giulio Bottazzi

Research Activity skills: Dr. Moschella's research is grounded in empirical microeconomics and mainly focused on the statistical analysis of firm-level data. He explored the microeconomics of firms, in particular the aspects of innovation and the dynamics of productivity, both from a present-day and historical perspective. This double approach broadened the spectrum of his actual publications. While his work is not particularly innovative from the methodological point of view, he adopts adequate state-of-the-art methods and applies them to original investigations. In general, I appreciate the rigor of analysis of Dr. Moschella's work. While all the papers were coauthored, a common pattern of analysis emerges that allows to clearly identify the relevance of his contribution.

Teaching Activity skills: The candidate collected several teaching experiences both at the graduate and undergraduate levels. Particularly relevant is the experience in teaching basic courses, whose topics lay outside of the direct research experience of the candidate.

Participation in research projects: Before becoming a research fellow at Sabt'Anna the candidate won an important project at the national level. As Sant'Anna research fellow, Dr. Moschella played an active role in several international projects. He collaborated with people from different institutions, academic and not, and he is part of an active and productive international research network.

Publishing activity: Dr. Moschella did not have any responsibility as an editor or associated editor in major journals, which is normal for a scholar at his career stage. He served as a referee for several relevant field journals.

Overall evaluation: Based on his CV and publications, my overall judgment of Dr. Moschella is positive. His publication record is relevant, continuous, and internationally recognized. His teaching experience is solid. In his entire career, he displayed the capability and inclination to collaborate with other researchers and to play an active role in important research projects at the national and international levels.

Prof. Fulvio Castellacci

Research activity:
Daniele Moschella has published so far 11 articles in international peer-reviewed journals. Some of the articles are published in prestigious journals in the fields of innovation studies and the economics of innovation. His publication activity and results show continuous progress and steady
improvement over time. The themes of his contributions are quite broad, showing a variety of research interests within the economics of innovation and empirical industrial dynamics. Moschella has also been active to disseminate his work in international academic networks (workshops, conferences).

**Teaching activity:**
The candidate has taught courses at both Master and PhD levels. He reports very good student evaluations from one of the courses he taught. Moschella shows evidence of skills in teaching and supervision, which he will certainly be able to apply and develop further in the coming years.

**Participation in research projects:**
Moschella has participated in both national and international research projects during the current contract period. His broad international network indicates that he will be able to continue to participate in research projects in the future.

**Publishing activity:**
He contributed to peer review activities as referees for some international journals.

**Summary evaluation:**
Daniele Moschella has an interesting, broad and relevant research profile. Combining empirical skills and a breadth of thematic interests, the candidate has been active and productive in terms of publication activities, research projects and national and international networks and dissemination. He has good teaching experience and results, which he will certainly extend further in the coming years. In summary, my assessment is that the candidate does indeed deserve a promotion to Associate Professor.

Pof. Valentina Meliciani

**Research Activity skills:** Dr. Moschella's research focuses on firm level empirical analyses. The work has solid theoretical underpinnings in the framework of the technology gap approach. The methodologies used are robust and exploit large data sets allowing to take track of firms’ heterogeneity. The results are relevant and they are published in high impact international journals.

**Teaching Activity skills:** The teaching experience is broad also considering the age of Dr. Moschella. The capability to teach at the PhD level and to supervise PhD students is particularly appreciated.
Participation in research projects: Dr. Moschella has participated in many research projects at the national and international level showing evidence of being part of a large and prestigious research network.

Publishing activity: Dr. Moschella does not show evidence of serving as an editor or associate editor. He has been acting as referee for many international journals.

Overall evaluation: My overall evaluation of Dr. Moschella is very positive considering both the relevance, impact and methodological rigour of his publications, the relevant teaching activity and the active role in research projects and international conferences.

Prof. Pierre Mohnen

Research activity skills
During the present period of contract, he has published in 5 peer-reviewed academic journals and before that in 6 peer-reviewed journals, some of which rank among the best journals in the field of innovation. He has also contributed to two book chapters. He has published with many different authors. Given his age and status in the profession, this is more a sign of the quality of his input than a sign of free-riding. He is also quite active in disseminating his research findings in conferences and seminars.

Teaching activity skills
Daniele Moschella has not taught many courses yet because he is not required to. In the present contract he only had to teach two courses, one PhD course and one MSc course. For the former,
there is no evaluation and in any case the number of students was too low for an evaluation to make much sense. For the latter, he received excellent student evaluations. Given these facts, I would consider his teaching activities to be sufficiently good. Besides these teaching duties, he has also supervised successfully one PhD dissertation.

**Participation in research projects**

The candidate has been involved in many different nationally and internationally funded research projects. The fact that he is repeatedly asked to contribute to such research projects is a sign that his input is appreciated.

**Publishing activity**

He has not edited any special issue or book, but he has fulfilled his professional duties as peer-reviewer for various academic journals in his field.

**Overall evaluation**

In my opinion, Dr. Moschella satisfies the criteria for becoming an associate professor.

Prof. Massimo Riccaboni

**Research activity skills**

During the contract period (2018-2021), Daniele Moschella has published five articles in prestigious international peer-reviewed journals. Before the contract period (2017-2011), he published six articles in peer-reviewed journals, some of which are top in field journals, and two book chapters. The candidate has been quite active in presenting his work in conferences, workshops, and seminars. All published works are co-authored with one or more colleagues. The candidate's contribution to co-authored publications is identifiable in related and coherent research topics and methodological skills.

**Teaching activity skills**

Daniele Moschella has taught courses at the undergraduate and graduate levels. During the contract period, he taught the Industrial Organization Ph.D. course of the Sant'Anna-IUSS joint Ph.D. in Economics and a master course. The evaluation of the students is available only for the latter. Students' evaluation is extremely positive. The candidate has also supervised a Ph.D. student. Overall, the candidate's teaching experience is still limited, but it includes teaching activity at the graduate level, positively evaluated by students.
Participation in research projects
During the contract period, the candidate has been involved in one national and one international research project. Besides participating in other projects, he has been the principal investigator of a SIR project before the contract period.

Publishing activity
Daniele Moschella served as a peer reviewer of some international journals but did not have any responsibility as an (associated) editor of scientific journals.

Overall evaluation
Daniele Moschella has a relevant, continuous, visible, and innovative scientific production in A-ranked journals, collaborating with co-authors in Italy and abroad. He is experienced in teaching courses and advising students at the graduate level. Available student evaluations are very positive. The candidate has been active in multiple research projects and he has been the principal investigator of a research project in the past. Although the candidate does not have any editorial role yet, he served as a peer reviewer for some field journals. All in all, the candidate meets the criteria for becoming an associate professor.
Annex 2
COLLEGIATE ASSESSMENT

Research activity skills
The themes of Dr. Moschella’s contributions are quite broad, showing a variety of research interests within the economics of innovation and empirical industrial dynamics. During the contract period, the candidate has published five articles in prestigious international peer-reviewed journals. Before the contract period, he published six articles in peer-reviewed journals, some of which are top in field journals, and two book chapters. The candidate has been quite active in presenting his work in conferences, workshops, and seminars.

Teaching activity skills
The candidate has taught courses at the undergraduate and graduate levels. When available, students' evaluation of Dr. Moschella teaching activity is extremely positive. The candidate has also supervised a Ph.D. student.

Participation in research projects
During the contract period, the candidate has been involved in one national and one international research project. Besides participating in other projects, he has been the principal investigator of a SIR project before the contract period. His broad international network indicates that he will be able to continue to participate in research projects in the future.

Publishing activity
The candidate has fulfilled his professional duties as peer-reviewer for important international academic journals in his field.

Overall evaluation
In our opinion, Dr. Moschella satisfies the criteria for becoming an associate professor.